

Additional representations for Scarborough & Whitby AC Planning Committee to be held on 13 July 2023

Below is a summary of the additional representations received by the Local Planning Authority in respect of the below applications since the publication of the Officers' reports on 5 July 2023. The full comments and any associated documentation are available to view on the Council's website.

ITEM 6. ZF23/00616/LB - Old Town Hall Church Street Whitby North Yorkshire YO22 4AE

Proposal: Refurbishment works including a new levelled stepped access platform, power and lighting, external and internal repairs, and alterations to the first floor including upgrading the building fabric, services and WC/ kitchenette facilities

1.1 Three further letters of objection to the proposal have been received by the Council. These are from local residents and make the following points:

- The area should be left as an open space free for all to use when not in use as a market;
- The building should be maintained;
- People and organisations, including the RNLI, have a right to park on the Market Place;
- Any works which block

1.2 A letter of objection has been received from the Whitby Community Network. This makes the following points:

- A change of use as proposed leaves the use open to unsuitable options;
- Agree with the repairs;
- Extending the undercroft level into the Market Place is contrary to the Whitby Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Plan;
- The proposal fails to consider access for less mobile users of the Market Place.

1.3 A letter in support of the application has been received from Councillor Neil Swannick. Whilst stating that he supports the application he does not provide further comment.

1.4 The Georgian Group has submitted a letter of objection to the proposals. This makes the following points:

a) Removal of the stud wall, door and fire surround

The Group registers significant concerns that it is proposed to remove the lath and plaster partition wall and to remove 2no. six-panel doors and a central fire surround from the east end of the first floor.

The age and condition of these features is entirely undiscussed in the Heritage Statement however we advise that the position and symmetry of the doorways and fireplace suggests they are likely to be part of the original design of the building. It is

however unclear if the 6 panel doors or fire surround are historic.

We advise that without further discussion of the age or significance of these fixtures the application fails to meet the requirements of NPPF (2021) paragraph 194.

We further advise that the lack of specific information may also prevent the LPA from fulfilling their responsibility under NPPF paragraph 195.

The Group therefore queries how it has been determined that these features – which are potentially original to the building, have been determined to be only of ‘medium value’ in the Heritage Statement.

We advise that as the arrangement of doors and fireplace is likely original to the building that it must be considered to be of high significance with strong evidential and aesthetic value contributing to the overall special architectural significance of the building as a Grade II* listed heritage asset. The proposed interventions to disrupt this symmetry and ‘strip out’ probable original built fabric would therefore cause significant and irreversible harm to the historic fabric and character of the building. This harm would be increased if the doors and/or fire surround are also historic.

We therefore advise that the proposals fail to meet the requirements of NPPF paragraph 199.

We further advise that the justification for the proposed works is neither clear nor convincing and the proposal thereby fails to meet the requirements of NPPF paragraph 200.

The Group recommends that the applicant provides further information regarding the age, condition and significance of these fixtures and should revise the application to retain the existing designed arrangement of the room.

b) Installation of kitchenette and WC

The Group also objects to the proposed installations of a kitchenette and WC, we advise that the alterations would cause considerable harm to the designed composition of the FF room, altering the historic room volume and disrupting the symmetry of the space. This harm would be in addition to the proposed stripping out works discussed above.

We therefore advise that this proposal thereby again fails to meet the requirements of NPPF paragraphs 199 and 200.

c) Repairs and works to masonry, windows, bellcote and roof

The Group welcomes the proposed repairs and conservation works to the masonry, windows, bellcote, and roof of the Old Town Hall. We strongly recommend however that the applicant submits a full method statement and schedule of works explaining and specifying details of the proposed materials and scope of works.

We advise that these should be submitted for assessment and approval prior to LBC

being determined.

d) Relationship to application ZF23/00618/LB

The application appears to be dependent on other applications for the glazing-in of the ground floor.

e) Conclusion

The Group must advise that the proposed scheme of works would cause significant and irreversible harm to the special architectural and historical significance of the Old Town Hall as a Grade II* Listed Building.

The Group's letter should be understood to be advisory to the Planning Committee. If the Committee resolves to grant consent, we do **not** require that the Secretary of State be notified.

1.5 The Whitby Civic Society has submitted a letter in support of the application. This makes the following points:

- The Whitby Civic Society has repeatedly drawn attention to the deteriorating fabric of the Grade II* Listed Town Hall;
- Whilst the former Scarborough Borough Council's repair projects in the recent past have been welcomed, it is clear that a sustainable use for this heritage asset needs to be found;
- Whitby Civic Society therefore endorses Whitby Town Council's response of no objections.

ITEM 5. ZF23/00615/RG3 - Old Town Hall Church Street Whitby North Yorkshire YO22 4AE

Proposal: Change of use of Old Town Hall building to a sui generis use comprising the following classes of uses defined by the Use Class Order: 1) Class E(a) Display or retail sale of goods, other than hot food; 2) Class F1 (b) Display of works of arts; 3) F1(c) Museums; and, 4) F2(b) Halls or meeting places for the principal use of the local community. Operational development including new access and improvements to public realm and market facilities.

1.6 A letter in support of the application has been received from Councillor Neil Swannick. Whilst stating that he supports the application he does not provide further comment.

1.7 The Whitby Civic Society has submitted a letter in support of the application. This makes the following points:

- The Whitby Civic Society has repeatedly drawn attention to the deteriorating fabric of the Grade II* Listed Town Hall;
- Whilst the former Scarborough Borough Council's repair projects in the recent past have been welcomed, it is clear that a sustainable use for this heritage asset needs to be found;
- Whitby Civic Society therefore endorses Whitby Town Council's response of no objections.